

Report of	Chief Operating Officer	Author	Richard Clifford ☎ 507832
Title	Decisions Reviewed by the Scrutiny Panel – Review of Saturday Household Drop Off Service		
Wards affected	All wards		

1. Executive Summary

1.1 Cabinet are asked to consider the outcome of the call in of the decision by the Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste to review the Saturday Household Drop Off Service. The call in was considered by the Scrutiny Panel at its meeting of 3 March 2023, where it made recommendations to the Portfolio Holder, which the Portfolio Holder has not accepted. In these circumstances the decision is referred to Cabinet to determine.

2. Recommended Decision

2.1 To determine the decision by the Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste to review the Saturday Household Drop Off Service in view of the recommendations made by the Scrutiny Panel following the call in of the decision.

3. Reason for Recommended Decision

3.1 Where the Portfolio Holder does not accept a recommendation from the Scrutiny Panel following a call in, the decision is referred to Cabinet to determine.

4. Alternative Options

4.1 No alternative options are proposed..

5. Background Information

5.1 The decision taken by the Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste on 9 February 2023, to change the current free operating model for the Saturday Household Drop-off Service, was called in by Councillor Sue Lissimore, as Lead Member for the call in request, on 20 February 2023. The four necessary indications of support were received from Councillors Tate, Hagon, Buston, and Barber, and the call in request was declared valid by the Council's Monitoring Officer.

5.2 The text covering the grounds given for the call in request, as submitted by Councillor Lissimore, was as follows (verbatim):

- *No consultation with residents.*
- *No consultation with staff.*
- *Will increase fly tipping.*
- *Will affect those most vulnerable who do not have access to a vehicle.*
- *Is against the Council's Climate policy as it will increase vehicular movements going to recycling centres.*
- *Will increase domestic waste collection services.*

5.3 No informal mediation for the call in was held as the Portfolio Holder indicated that he did not consider it was necessary.

5.4 The Scrutiny Panel considered the call in at its meeting on 3 March 2023. Councillor Lissimore, as the lead on the call in and Councillor Goss, Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste, both attended the meeting and made representations to the Panel.

5.5 Whilst the full minutes of the meeting have not yet been finalised, the Scrutiny Officer has prepared the summary of the meeting, which includes the full text of the recommendation made by the Scrutiny Panel.

As Lead member on the call-in, Councillor Lissimore presented and explained the reasons given for challenging the decision in question. Councillor Goss, as Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste then answered these points and explained how the decision had been taken. The Panel discussed each of the points raised and considered whether enough consultation had occurred, and whether it agreed with the challenges concerning effects on fly tipping, other Council services and on residents.

The Panel noted the explanation of the Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste regarding the work which officers of the Council had done in relation to this decision, showing that consultation of officers had occurred, however concern was raised that no consultation of the public or councillors had been carried out. The Portfolio Holder explained that only 120 out of 193,000 residents used the service [0.06%], and that consultation was not carried out as the users of the service consisted of less than 1% of the population. The Panel discussed this, and asked questions about Cabinet's approach to consultations and what the percentage of residents being affected by a decision would lead to a consultation. The Panel raised concern that there was no policy or guidance to guide Portfolio Holders as to when consultation should be carried out of residents and councillors in regard to decisions taken.

The Panel considered the concerns regarding the likely effects on vulnerable residents, council services and fly tipping rates. Individual members of the Panel voiced their concerns as to the potential effects, however the Panel decided that the final three points raised in the call-in, as shown above, could not be evidenced. The view was given that it could not be shown that the decision taken would affect those without a vehicle or go against climate policies due to increasing vehicle journeys to recycling centres (as almost all would need access to a vehicle to transport waste items to the current collection points), or that there would be an increase in use of domestic waste collection services.

The Panel discussed the potential for increased fly tipping, and increased costs of dealing with this. The Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste gave the view that no increase was expected and therefore no increased cost had been factored into the estimate of the savings generated by this decision. Panel members expressed concern that no information or consideration regarding this issue was contained in the decision report.

RESOLVED that the decision WAS-002-22 [Review of Saturday Household Drop-off Service] be referred back to the Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste, for further consideration, with the recommendation that the Portfolio Holder addresses the following concerns: -

- (a) That the decision had not been subject to consultation and the Panel was concerned that there did not appear to be a policy or formal guidance to guide Cabinet and individual portfolio holders as to how to approach consultations and in what circumstances they should be carried out;*
- (a) That the potential for increased fly tipping which may be caused by this decision has not been addressed, that more data analysis of the likelihood of this happening should have been conducted and content included in the decision report to lay out the expected effects and additional costs to the Council, even if it no increase in fly tipping or Council costs is expected.*

5.6 The Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste has indicated that he does not accept the recommendations from the Scrutiny Panel. In these circumstances, the matter is referred to the Cabinet to determine the matter.

6 Standard References

6.1 There are no references to the Strategic Plan; consultation or publicity considerations or financial; community safety; health and safety or risk management implications arising from this report. The implications from the proposed decision are set out in the Portfolio Holder report at Appendix B.

Appendices

Appendix A –Review of Saturday Household Drop Off Service Decision Notice

Appendix B – Review of Saturday Household Drop Off Service – report by Portfolio Holder for Neighbourhood Services and Waste